Final reflection, or perhaps, a little provocation

Bradley Levinson

Powerful, generative insights and perennial anthropological strengths

- Citizenship as relational practice, rather than "status"; citizenship as a contingent, open process of construction vis-à-vis the state and other imagined political communities

- Historicize, historicize, historicize

- Radical openness and variability in the forms of "education," "self-making" and "collective-making" from below, always with/in historically given constraints and resources; speaking back to dominant assumptions and conceits

Remaining questions

- Citizenship as relational practice vis-à-vis state only, or other publics/polities?
- The challenge of the vernacularization of citizenship: There are "good citizens" everywhere
- Where's the state, **how's** the state?
- Where did democracy go? Can we have "undemocratic" education contribute to democracy?
- How does our anthropological knowledge relate to/contribute to democratic processes and social movements? Do/can we "democratize?"

The normative and empirical-analytic

- Anthropological scholarship should *not* endeavor to separate these two modes of reasoning

- Reflexive declaration of normative commitments, often evolved in dialogue with research participants, which inform research questions and procedures

- Sources and traditions: Critical theory (CT) and feminism, pragmatism, Latin American CT, B. Flyvbjerg's 'phronetic' social science, and M. Somers' historical sociology of citizenship

Groping toward a definition

- *Citizenship is a form of relational practice constituted by the meanings, rights, and obligations of membership in* publics, *as well as the forms of agency and subjectivity, and modalities of participation, implicated by such membership*.

- Publics =*The diverse social spaces configured beyond close kin and consociates, oriented to political action and the claiming of rights, but not fully encompassed by the state*

Elements of definition

- Citizenship as relational practice, rather than a 'status' or a 'condition'; placing emphasis on the ongoing practices of claims-making and membership

- State is primary, but not sole, granter of citizenship rights and obligations (decentering the State, nested or overlapping citizenship regimes)

- Notion of public as alternative to "civil society"; Understanding counterpublics (Nancy Fraser) and subaltern claims-making

Nancy Fraser defining "counterpublics" (1992)

"parallel discursive arenas where members of subordinate groups invent and circulate counterdiscourses to formulate oppositional interpretations of their identities, interests, and needs"

Defining democracy

- I would propose a normative definition of democracy to guide our inquiries: democracy is *the continual striving toward a social order (social group?) that fosters individual freedoms, sponsors reasoned deliberation, promotes members' participation in decision-making, justly and equitably distributes political–economic power, and facilitates cultural inclusiveness*

Critical anthropology of democracy examines:

- How, and how "continual," the striving is (versus the ossifying effects of restrictive provisions),

- whether and how different cultural *forms* of reason and argumentation are admitted into deliberation (as an act of cultural inclusiveness),

- what kinds of meaningful citizen participation are promoted, and

- to what extent, and in what manner, power is justly and equitably distributed.

Anthropology of democratic citizenship *education* therefore examines:

- efforts by such democratic (counter) publics to educate their members to imagine their social belonging and exercise their participation as democratic citizens.